		eport to Donor	
Ref.	TF015355	Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	12/18/2019	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

Assignment: TF015355

Second Grant Agreement for the Republic of Cameroon Readiness Preparation Proposal-Readiness Fund of the FCPF

FCPFR - Forest Carbon Partnership Facility

Task Team Leader:	00000512180	- Cyrille Valence Ngouana Kengne
	00000054047	

Approving Manager: 00000251917 - Africa Eshogba Olojoba

Summary Information			
TF Status	ACTV		
Recipient Country	Cameroon		
Executed By	Recipient		
Managing Unit	9835 - SAFE3		
Grant Start Date / End Date	12/23/2013 to 08/31/2019		
Original Grant Amount	3,600,000.00		
Grant Amount	3,600,000.00		
Outstanding Commitments	0.00		
Cumulative Disbursements	3,599,984.50 as of 06/30/2019		
Disbursed 12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019	3,599,984.50		
Donor	TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS		

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Components, Outcome, Execution, Program(FCPFR), Completion, Disbursements, Procurement Plan, Procurement Actuals.

Report to Donor			
Ref.	TF015355	Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	12/18/2019	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

OVERVIEW

Overall Assessments

Grant Objectives:

The Project Development Objective is to reinforce Cameroon's capacities to design a socially and environmentally sound national strategy to reduce emissions from deforestation and forest degradation (REDD+) and to develop a national reference scenario of emissions from deforestation and degradation that takes into account national circumstances.

Overall progress from 12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

Comment:

The grant objectives were partially achieved with grant support. The National REDD+ management arrangements have been well established and maintained. Specific outputs of the Readiness process supported by the grant include a National REDD+ Strategy; a Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (including an Environmental and Social Management Framework; Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF), Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework (IPPF) and Process Framework (PF)). Work on the appropriate Benefit Sharing Mechanism (BSM) and, feedback and Grievance Redress Mechanism (FGRM) for REDD+ was also completed. Over 4000 people have been consulted since the grant agreement was signed and communication materials and tools were developed. The R-Package was endorsed in March 2019.

The ER Program for Cameroon covers seven administrative divisions within three administrative regions: Dja et Lobo, Ocean, Vallée du Ntem, Mvila (South region); Nyong et So#o, Nyong et Mfoumou (Centre region) and Haut Nyong (East region). Formulation of the program started in July 2017 but the Government failed to submit his ERPD in June 2018, December 2018 and July 2019 as scheduled. Noting the short time frame available for finalization and implementation of complex, large-scale emission reductions programs, CFPs decided in July 2019 not to extend the deadline for submission of final Cameroon's ERPDs. Objectives are partially achieved because the National Forest Emissions Reference Level (FREL), Safeguards Information System (SIS) and the REDD+ Registry are still to be developed. Subnational REDD+ institutional arrangements are not set up and in addition the MRV system needs to be operationalized.

Overall progress from 12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities: Comment:

Overall implementation is MU with a very low pace of implementation. The majority of the activities are pending after 5-6 years of implementation. After the Grant effectiveness in December 23, 2013, the initial grant advanced was transferred to client account in March 2014. The Project activities were officially launched on June 11, 2014. The Mid term review mission was undertaken in December 2015 and confirmed delay in the implementation of the grant. Two extensions of the closing dates of the grant were approved to increase the opportunity to achieve the Grant Development Objective. The grant was respectively extended from July 21, 2016 to September 30, 2018 and from September 30 to December 31, 2018. With these two extensions, all activities were not completed as planned by the grant closing date.

Grant follow-up and structure

Description and context of Grant:

The grant funded activities are organized into four components as follows

Component 1. Organization and Consultation/National Readiness Management Arrangements

Description: This component included support for national and subnational-level coordination and monitoring of the REDD+ process, including the project management costs, and strengthen broad stakeholder engagement in the REDD+ process, support communication on REDD+, conduct consultations on specific issues related to REDD+ Readiness process.

Component 2. Preparation of the REDD+ Strategy

Description: This component included two major activities: (i) Preparation of the REDD+ Strategy and (ii) Conducting a Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA) and production of the Environment and Social Management Framework (ESMF); Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF), Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework (IPPF) and Process Framework (PF).

Component 3. Status of Activities on the Forest Reference Level (FRL)/Forest Reference Emission Level (FREL) Description: The country uses historic changes and future adjustments to develop its FRL and submit to the UNFCCC Component 4. Design Systems for National Forest Monitoring and Safeguard Information System Description: The objective of this component is to continue supporting the National Forest Monitoring System by

Report to Donor			
Ref.	TF015355	Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	12/18/2019	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

institutionalizing/operationalizing and implementing the MRV monitoring system and its deployment at regional/zonal level. The design and establishment of the Safeguards Information System is also under this component.

Expected follow up (if any): Follow up project or grant (non-Bank funded)

Comment on follow up:

Per ER-P, a Public Private Partnership was signed in December 2017 in Bonn, Germany between the Government of Cameroon and Taylor Guitars, and Cameroon used PIF Grant to complete in December 2018 the feasibility study to scale up The Ebony Project as called for in the Public-Private-Partnership Agreement signed .

Under the Central Africa Forest Initiative (CAFI), Cameroon produced a draft National Investment Framework (NIF) in December 2017. A second draft was shared with CAFI EB in March 2019 and comments of the independent evaluators as well as the comments of the EB members were received in April 2019. The draft NIF is still under enrichment and

it is resulting in a portfolio of potential forest-smart interventions in Low-carbon impact agriculture, landscape restoration, promotion of the efficient use of wood energy, and other cross-cutting aspects such as land-use planning and governance. The readiness could then be used to leverage additional investments in natural resources management, however it will be largely dependent on the successful implementation of the additional funding signed on March 28, 2019 because Cameroon was not able to meet deadlines set by the CFPs for submission of final ERPDs.

End Date of Last Site Visit:

Restructuring of Grant:

Due to the delay in the implementation of the grant activities, two extensions of the grant closing date were granted and the latest closing date was December 31, 2018.

OUTCOME

Comments on outcome achieved from 12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019

Two CSOs/IPs platforms and other NGOs engaged for strengthening participatory structures; feedback and grievance redress mechanism review completed.

The National REDD+ Strategy was completed in June 2018. In-depth analysis of drivers of deforestation and forest degradation and strategic options, which informed the National REDD+ Strategy are available.

The R-Package was endorsed in March 2019 and the Additional Funding signed on March 28, 2019.

Grant Outcome Indicators

Grant outcome indicators are listed below.

National strategy to reduce emissions from deforestation and forest degradation (REDD+)

Baseline Value:	0
Date:	12/16/2013
Progress to Date:	Draft Strategy available
Date:	12/18/2017
Target Value: Date:	A national strategy to reduce emissions from deforestation and forest degradation (REDD+) adopted 06/22/2018

		Report to Donor	
	TF015355	Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
ted On:	12/18/2019	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved
The legal a national st		e implementation of the strategy i	s prepared and validated by
Baseline Value:	0		
Date:	12/16/2013		
Progress to Date:	0		
Date:	04/14/2015		
Target Value	: The legal and institutional framewor	rk are in place	
Date:	04/12/2016		
SESA and s	afeguards frameworks are particip	patory prepared and validated	
Baseline Value:	0		
Date:	12/16/2013		
Progress to Date:	Draft SESA		
Date:	02/15/2017		
Target Value	e: SESA and safeguards frameworks are	e participatory prepared and validated	
Date:	04/16/2018		
The R-Pack	age is prepared and validated by a	national stakeholders	
Baseline Value:	0		
Date:	12/16/2013		
Progress to Date:	0		
Date:	12/12/2016		
Target Value	: The R-Package endorsed		
Date:	03/18/2019		
Reference	Emissions Level submitted to the	UFCCC	
Baseline Value:	0		
Date:	12/16/2013		
Progress to Date:	draft national FREL		
Date:	12/18/2019		

Date:

Target Value: National FREL submitted

03/19/2020

	· · ·	- • •	-
	Report to Donor		
	TF015355	Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
ed On:	12/18/2019	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved
MRV system	n is operational		
Baseline Value:	0		
Date:	12/16/2013		
Progress to Date:	0		
Date:	11/13/2018		
Target Value	e: MRV system is operational		
Date:	06/23/2020		
The REDD+	registry is established		
Baseline Value:	0		
Date:	03/28/2019		
Progress to Date:	0		
Date:	09/20/2019		
Target Value	: The REDD+ registry is established		
Date:	06/26/2020		
A minimum	of one jurisdictional Emission Reductions Program	is finalized	
Baseline Value:	Draft available		
Date:	03/21/2019		

Progress to advanced draft Date: Date: 02/19/2020 Target Value: 06/26/2020

COMPONENTS

Output and Implementation by Component

Organization and Consultation/National Readiness Management Arrangements

Status:Under ImplementationPlanned Output:Setting up Subnational REDD + arrangements and the FGRM also needs to be established and tested.Actual Output:The national REDD+ readiness management arrangements, Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) and
Indigenous Peoples (IP) Planforms have been established and are functioning

		Report to Dono	r	
f.	TF015355		Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
nted On:	12/18/2019		Report Type:	Completion
			Report Status:	Approved
Prepar	ation of the	REDD+ Strategy and Conduct SESA		
Status:		Under Implementation		
Planned	d Output:	Setting up of the REDD+ Registry is pending		
Actual Output: The formulation of		The formulation of the National REDD+ Strat	egy was completed in Jun	e 2018
Develo	opment of a	National Forest Reference Level		
Status: Under Implementation				
Planned Output: The national FREL needs to be established an the Safeguards Information System		nd submitted to UNFCCC.	The design and establishment o	
-		The national FREL needs to be established a the Safeguards Information System	nd submitted to UNFCCC.	The design and establishment o
Design	Systems for	National Forest Monitoring and Informa	ation on Safeguards	
Status: Under Implementation				
Planned Output: The MRV guidelines needs to be consolidated a		l and operationalized		

Comment on planned and actual Output

Actual Output:

Comment on component implementation progress

A MRV Guidelines was developed.

Component 1: Organization and Consultation/National Readiness Management Arrangements: The national REDD+ readiness management arrangements, Civil Society Organizations (CSOs) and Indigenous Peoples (IP) Planforms have been established and are functioning. At country level, the REDD+ Steering Committee and the REDD+ Technical Secretariat have been established and are operational. CSOs platform has regional branches. Over 4000 people have been consulted since the grant agreement was signed. Work on the appropriate Benefit Sharing Mechanism (BSM) and, feedback and Grievance Redress Mechanism (FGRM) for REDD+ were completed.

Subnational REDD + arrangements need to be set up and the FGRM also needs to be established and tested.

Component 2. Preparation of the REDD+ Strategy and Conduct SESA: The formulation of the National REDD+ Strategy was completed in June 2018. In-depth analysis of drivers of deforestation and forest degradation and strategic options, which informed the National REDD+ Strategy are available. The Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA), preparation of frameworks: Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF); Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF), Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework (IPPF) and Process Framework (PF) were prepared and cleared by the Regional Safeguards Advisor in July 2018.

A self-assessment workshop for the R-Package took place in May/June 2018. The R-Package was endorsed by the FCPF Participants Committee in March 2019.

Setting up of the REDD+ Registry is pending.

Component 3. Development of a National Forest Reference Level: The development of the national concept for reference scenario (Forest Reference Emissions Level (FREL) was completed and consensus was reached on: Forest definition; Scope and scale of the FRL/FREL and Land use/Landcover key category classes to be used for carbon stocks.

The national FREL needs to be established and submitted to UNFCCC. The design and establishment of the Safeguards Information System is also pending.

Component 4.Design Systems for National Forest Monitoring and Information on Safeguards: A MRV Guidelines was developed.

Report to Donor			
Ref.	TF015355	Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	12/18/2019	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

The MRV guidelines needs to be consolidated and operationalized.

EXECUTION

Bank project related to the grant

Project ID / Name:	P124293 - CM FCPF REDD READINESS
Project Status:	Lending
Global Focal Area:	Climate change
Product Line:	CN - Carbon Offset

Implementing agency and contact details

Agency:	Ministry of the Environment, Protection of Nature and Sustainable Development			
Contact:	Dr. Amadou Wassouni			
Address:	Yaounde, Cameroon			
Phone:	+237 99 75 14 84	Email:	wassouni.amadou@yahoo.fr	
Website:				

PROGRAM

Program Specific Questions

1. Describe progress in how the Grant activities are being coordinated with other REDD+-related initiatives, including those funded by Describe progress in how the Grant activities are being coordinated with other REDD+-related initiatives, including those f

Coordination with other partners was ensured : The CCPM REDD+ Sub-Group made up of technical and financial institutions working on REDD+ and related issues periodically meet to discuss. It provides a platform for participants to identify bottlenecks, discuss best practices, and exchange information and knowledge on solutions and pathways for moving the REDD+ agenda forward in Cameroon. In 2019, the CPM REDD+ Sub-Group meeting was hosted by CIFOR on the 23rd of January 2019; GIZ/ProPFE on Thursday 18th April 2019 and the World Bank on June 6, 2019. The preparation of the National Investment Framework (Under CAFI) is building on the REDD+ readiness efforts and findings.

2. Describe any important changes in the technical design or approach related to the Grant activities.

A consolidated timeline processes were agreed in January and September 2018 upon to accelerate REDD+ readiness activities but were poorly implemented.

3. Describe progress in addressing key capacity issues (implementation, technical, financial management, procurement) related to this Grant.

The project team capacity was strengthened through the mobilization of a safeguards specialist, legal analyst and a natural resources governance specialist. KfW international REDD+ Technical Coordinator was providing key support during most of the grant period, till June 2018. With the completion of the REDD+ national strategy in June 2018 and based on technical challenges associated with the AF and expected outcomes, new technical job profiles were developed in February 19 for the REDD+/Technical Secretariat. However, hiring of new experts has been delayed because of the lack of consensus on the recruitment process. As a matter of fact, technical experts are onboard.

Bank Task Team providing on time quality support, including on procurement and financial management.

Because of the documented embezzlement of funds by CSOs/Platforms in REDD+ and lapsed loans on the portfolio in Cameroon, new projects in Cameroon including AF are not allowed to open Designated Account (DA). CMU is working on that with the Governor to resolve the DA issue. However, direct payments and reimbursement are acceptable. There#s an invoice of ineligible expenditures pending refund on the Original FCPF Trust Fund: Total amount XAF 9,365,000. To reduce tension among CSOs and financial inconsistencies, following measure was applied: Direct allocation of funds to CSOs was banned in May

		port to Donor	
Ref.	TF015355	Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	12/18/2019	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

2018. To mitigate the above financial management risks, the client was supposed to update the administrative and financial management manual, update the ToR for the external auditor respectively within two and three months after the AF effectiveness. An acceptable version of the procedures manual that takes into account the AF specificities is still pending.

4. Describe progress in addressing social and environmental issues (including safeguards) related to the Grant. Is the SESA conducted in accordance with the Common Approach?

SESA was conducted in accordance with the Common Approach. SESA was prepared, including through a series of consultations. The SESA was also conducted consistent with Cameroonian environmental laws and regulations and World Bank operational safeguards policies and procedures.

5. Is the ESMF prepared in accordance with the Common Approach?

The ESMF was prepared in accordance with the common approach. It was approved in June 2018 by the Regional Safeguards Advisor and disclosed in March 2019. ESMF sets out the procedures to be followed for identifying, assessing, managing and mitigating the potential environmental and social impacts of REDD+ interventions once the details are fully defined in the context of the future implementation of REDD+. The ESMF development was also informed by sub-national and national consultations.

6. Describe progress in stakeholder consultation, participation, disclosure of information, and the FGRM related to this Grant.

Cameroon's National REDD+ Process engaged multi-stakeholder (including during consultations) decision-making processes. Stakeholders that were engaged in the REDD+ process included central government and local government institutions, CSOs, Academia, Private Sector and representatives of Indigenous people and Local Communities.

Over 4000 people consulted since the grant agreement was signed: in order to ensure that all stakeholder categories (including CSOs and IPOs) participate and are consulted upon during the National REDD+ Process, undertakings aiming at; i) Strengthening participatory structures; ii) Conducting capacity building trainings to enhance stakeholder engagement at national and sub national levels; iii) Communicating about REDD+ process and raising awareness about REDD+ were supported. Consultations were undertaken also specifically in defining national REDD+ Strategy options, SESA/ESMF, Benefit Sharing Mechanism (BSM) and, feedback and Grievance Redress Mechanism (FGRM).

COMPLETION

Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

Main lessons learned:

The main lessons revolve around issues of donor coordination, cross-sectoral coordination; capacity and sustainability and managing expectations.

1) Lessons on donor coordination

Despite different donor agencies having very different ways of working, a collegiate working relationship, reinforced through periodic meetings has meant that any differences in approach can be resolved and addressed. KfW/Basket funds contributed to hire technical experts whereas the FCPF grant supported the fiduciary team. Periodic meetings involved JICA; KfW; GIZ; CIFOR; US Forest Program; WWF. Transparency International, IUCN; etc.

2) Cross-sectoral coordination. Addressing deforestation and forest degradation requires effective inter-sectoral coordination and engagement with the agriculture, land use planning and energy sectors. However, the low level of MINEPDED#s leadership of the process slowed down the interest of other state departments in charge of forests, agriculture, energy, mining, land tenure, etc. The REDD+ process needs to be hosted by an institution with a cross-cutting mandate and with a real convening power.

3) Capacity and sustainability. Although capacity for implementing REDD+ at the national has been strengthened, Cameroon over-relied on consultants and public institutions at closure lack the capacity to implement activities. MRV and SESA Task Forces were supposed to be set up to provide advice and support the process but it didn't take place. It has then been highly ineffective in ensuring external linkages to organizations outside MINEPDED, such as Ministries of Energy and Agriculture both of whom have valuable data that can be used in assessing forest and carbon stocks.

There has been delay in provision of counterpart funding, which caused delay in the timely holding of steering committee

		port to Donor	
Ref.	TF015355	Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	12/18/2019	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

meetings. In addition, key institutions to be involved in the MRV, FREL, etc. institutional arrangements have not been properly engaged. There is a gap between the time the Readiness grant ends and the time the first effects will happen on the groundand later the time when result-based payments are provided, either because the ERP is delayed or because the country may need time to see the effect of the investments and the sectoral reforms.

4) Managing Expectations. Preparing Cameroon to be ready for REDD+ implementation is a process that has been delayed. The REDD+ landscape is dramatically changing and many stakeholders really want to see concrete actions and investments on the ground.

Overall outcome (and its Sustainability):

Comment:

The grant financed activities partially achieved their objectives. The REDD+ dialog enhanced attention to the drivers of deforestation and forest degradation. Sector (agriculture, collection of firewood; etc.) that at the root of deforestation and forest degradation and hotspots are now known and the REDD+ will be gradually mainstreamed in national development programs, projects and national development plans. The Rural Sector Development Strategy has chosen the REDD+ process has an operationalization tool to catalyze rural investments. The National Investment Framework(under CAFI) is building on the REDD+ process findings to develop a National Investment Framework. This NIF implementation will be part of a holistic low emissions development investment frameworks that include national policy reforms and measures addressing drivers of deforestation and forest degradation.

Bank Performance:

Comment:

The Bank team provided close support and technical advise throughout implementation of the grant financed activities.

Additional Assessment

Development / strengthening of institutions:

Comment:

The capacity of the REED+ Technical Secretariat and the Ministry of Environment to handle REDD+ is weak and a strategic selection of relatively small well-placed individuals within key institutions will be a good approach. Given that membership will be based on individual expertise rather than institutional mandate, it will enable to "hand-pick" individuals with the right level of expertise and specific role to ensure that functionality can be maintained within a relatively small group of team members.

Mobilization of other resources:

Comment:

There has been delay in provision of counterpart funding, which caused delay in the timely holding of steering committee meetings. Cameroon currently has no funding committed for implementation of its National REDD+ Strategy. The additional funding will contribute to develop technical approaches to mobilize resources for implementation of the REDD+ Strategy. The most suited funding sources- public and private, multilateral, bilateral, and national # to implement the different actions proposed, including mainstreaming REDD+ into national policies and programs will be funded. It will also include a clear, realistic and costed action plan that defines roles and responsibilities for implementation.

Knowledge exchange:

Comment:

The Cameroon REDD+ team has been a part of many learning events on REDD+ supported by the FCPF and other sources

Client's policy / program implementation:

Comment:

Cameroon has sound policy related to forestry; implementation has been fairly weak, though. Forestry law is under revision and the land use planning processes is also under transformation.

		Report to Donor	
Ref.	TF015355	Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	12/18/2019	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

Efficiency:

Comment:

Outcomes planned at the onset have been partially achieved, thus efficiency is rated Moderately satisfactory

Replicability:

Comment:

The REDD+ Readiness process resulted in a number of useful outputs - however, this process is unlikely to be replicated without dedicated donor support.

Main recommendations to stakeholders:

Many key stakeholders including financial partners in Cameroon are fed up with the lengthy readiness phase and now more interested in REDD+ pilot projects.

The REDD+ Readiness process has identified several thematic areas deemed integral to addressing drivers of deforestation wherein need for government policy, legislative and institutional reform: forest law; land use zoning and planning; tree ownership, and forest tenure security for local communities. Legislation and regulation related to REDD+ activities haven#t been adopted and could be lengthy in a poor governance context. Key stakeholders should support the facilitation of the policy dialogue that strengthens the enabling environment for the development of Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD+) carbon operations.

Main recommendations to Bank Management:

The REDD+ process is evolving and funding landscape has also changed dramatically. Donors as well as most stakeholders would like to see concrete actions in the field rather classical readiness activities. Support from the FMT needs to be adequate at all times.

DISBURSEMENTS

Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
07/01/2013	12/31/2013	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2014	06/30/2014	0.00	0.00	379,226.80	379,226.80
07/01/2014	12/31/2014	0.00	0.00	553,420.46	174,193.66
01/01/2015	06/30/2015	0.00	0.00	855,335.27	301,914.81
07/01/2015	12/31/2015	0.00	0.00	1,032,307.30	176,972.03
01/01/2016	06/30/2016	0.00	0.00	1,371,201.23	338,893.93
07/01/2016	12/31/2016	0.00	0.00	1,642,810.18	271,608.95
01/01/2017	06/30/2017	0.00	0.00	1,881,209.94	238,399.76
07/01/2017	12/31/2017	0.00	0.00	3,022,293.44	1,141,083.50
01/01/2018	06/30/2018	0.00	0.00	3,233,554.53	211,261.09
07/01/2018	12/31/2018	0.00	0.00	3,600,000.00	366,445.47
01/01/2019	06/30/2019	0.00	0.00	3,599,984.50	15.50-
07/01/2019	12/31/2019	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00

		eport to Donor	
Ref.	TF015355	Reporting Period:	12/23/2013 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	12/18/2019	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

PROCUREMENT PLAN

None

PROCUREMENT ACTUAL

None